# BARRIERS TO IN-PLACE RECYCLING

State Agency Discussions on why in-place recycling is not utilized more in your states.

# PLACE RECYCLING IN SOUTH CAROLINA

Jim Garling, PE Pavement & Technology Engineer FHWA, South Carolina Division Office Melissa Campbell, PE State Materials Engineer SCDOT Office of Materials & Research

#### **DOT Facts** ,459 Centerline Miles of Roads 89,976 Lane Miles of Roads 🖬 8,344 Bridges • 4<sup>th</sup> Largest Highway in US 4<sup>th</sup> from Lowest Gas Tax Gas Tax Last Increased in 1987 -Approximately \$1.05 Billion in Funding ■ About 4,500 employees



#### □ …a Nittany Lion ???



State Animal?

NO, none of the above..... it's actually ---->





# **DOT Facts**

- 2010 Projects:
  - 278 Regular Letting
  - 45 ARRA Projects
- \$680 Million

# SCDOT's Experiences with In-Place Recycling

Very limited experience using Cold-in-Place Recycling with asphalt emulsion

Extensive experience with Full Depth Reclamation using Portland Cement

# SCDOT's Experience with In-Place Recycling

- First section of full depth reclamation with Portland cement constructed in 1997
- FDR with cement now done in 37 of 46 counties
- One district has done about 300 miles with FDR

# Full Depth Reclamation with Cement

# For Calendar Years 2009-2011 Non-Federal Aid 104 CL Miles \$28 M Federal Aid 155 CL Miles \$50M ARRA 27 CL Miles \$10 M

# Why We Chose In-Place Recycling

- FDR with Cement
  - Allows us to reclaim our investment
  - Creates a uniform base material
  - More cost effective than full depth patching and overlay

# Why in-Place Recycling is Not Utilized More in SC

- \$\$\$\$\$\$\$\$
- For Cold In-Place and Hot In-Place
  - Lack of experience
  - Concerns with process suitability on our raods
  - Success of FDR with Cement





Taylor Henderson, P.E. (Oklahoma Department of Transportation) Waseem Fazal, P.E. (FHWA- Oklahoma Division)

#### **Oklahoma- Facts**



- Area-69,919 square miles –Ranked 20<sup>th</sup>
- Population 3,642,361 -Ranked 28<sup>th</sup>
- Oklahoma has 13,000 centerline miles (31,500 lanes miles) State highway system 17<sup>th</sup> in Nation-miles maintained by SHA
- Interstates/ other NHS: 930/3,344 center line miles
- 77 Counties; ODOT has 8- Divisions- 25 Residencies

#### **Transportation Budget**

- State Transportation Budge FY-2011: 1.46 billion(State \$737 million & Federal \$730 million)
- ARRA FY-2009: 464.75 million obligated
- State Maintenance Budget: \$150 million
- Pavement Preservation Program: Started in 2004, funding about \$30 million annually

## In- Place Recycling- Options Projects- CIR

- US-412 Beaver & Harper counties (NW part of Oklahoma in pan handle)
- Major issue- Transverse cracking
- OSU(studied & evaluated CIR project with control a typical rehab treatment of ODOT mill& overlay)
- Design: CIR+2"overlay vs. milled surface asphaltic fabric over crack+3" HMA overlay
- After 3 years- CIR performed better in mitigating transverse cracks but with fatigue top down cracking
- Top down cracking was not failure a mechanism for this CIR rehab pavement in MEPDG analysis.
- Reason- may be a difference in binder grade PG 76-28 overlay to PG 58-28 for base asphalt of CSS emulsion

#### Pavement Preservation Program(3P) & HIR

in

- Concept- Keeping Good road good conditions
- Based on Pavement Management Data: Condition & structural indices, traffic data and local conditions
- Different options includes Hot In Place recycling (in lieu of medium overlay



#### Past HIR Projects Div. 5 Projects



• Most Division 5 projects are within a 50 mile radius of a rock quarry.

#### Concerns & Issues

- Non -availability of local contractor & technical expertise
- Local support from asphalt industry
- Cost effective- LCCA options
- Comfort level of engineers
- Oklahoma Conservative state in recycling
- Some failure in the past- premature failure of designed pavement- QC issues
- Good quality of aggregates available locally
- ODOT maintenance likes to use RAP- milled materials



# Southeastern States In-Place Recycling Conference

Atlanta, Georgia August 30 - September 1, 2011

Jim Phillips, PE FHWA - North Carolina Division

> Todd Whittington, PE NCDOT



# NC Demographics



- >2010 Census
  - $\circ$  Population ~ 9,535,483 (10<sup>th</sup> in the nation)

#### Largest City: CHARLOTTE

 $\circ$  Population ~ 731,500 (17<sup>th</sup> in the nation)

#### Smallest Town: DELLVIEW

 Population of 11 and regularly vies for the honor of smallest incorporated town in the U.S.



# NCDOT



- NCDOT has one of largest state maintained systems in the U.S.
- >~79,466 center line miles
- >~ 13,500 permanent positions
- ~ \$1.5B Centrally-let construction projects in 2010





# Hot-In-Place Recycling





# Hot-In-Place Recycling



- ≻ First Project let in 1997.
- ≻ Last HIPR Project let in 2008.
- Placed approximately 1.4 million square yards.
- ≻ "Mixed" success with HIPR.
  - Issues with Proper Project Selection
  - Issues with Final Mix Type/Size
  - Issues with Conformance with Opacity Tests
  - Only Contractor Left the State
- > Still part of New Specifications Book for 2012.

# **Cold-In-Place Recycling**



>Have only completed a couple of small Subdivision projects.

# **Full-Depth Reclamation**



➢ Been Using for about the Last 5 Years.

> Continue to Place Projects with Good Success.

 Every one of our 14 Highway Divisions have had investigations done for Candidate Projects.

• Will continue to locate new candidates.

➢NC is a Cement state... so far...

Have had inquiries about use of Asphalt-based FDR

# **Full-Depth Reclamation**



#### Do have a current Project Special Provision for use by our Divisions

	SECTION 541 FLEXIBLE PAVEMENT RECLAMATION USING PORTLAND CEMENT
541-1	DESCRIPTION
	Perform the work covered by this section, including but not limited to, reclamation of roadway by pulverizing, treating with Portland Cement, mixing, and compacting the existing asphalt pavement, base, subbase, and subgrade materials to a specified depth to produce a uniform mixture which meets density requirements.
541-2	MATERIALS
	Refer to Division 10: Portland Cement, Type I, II, 1SArticle 1024-1 WaterArticle 1024-4 Use asphalt, base, subbase and subgrade material existing in the area, or other materials proportioned by the Engineer, that is free from vegetation, roots, or other objectionable matter, and does not contain asphalt, aggregate or stone larger than 2 inches (50.8 mm).

# **Other Preservation Modes**



- Recent Annual Data
  - \$277 million to Resurface 1,062 road miles with HMA.
  - \$65.6 million to Surface Treat 2,769 road miles.
  - Solve the second state of the second s
- Investigating use of Fog Seals
- Developing Specification for new Thin-Lift mix type
- > Latest Budget pours more funds into:
  - Resurfacing: \$300 \$310M per year for next 3 years
  - Bridge Replace/Rehab: \$400M over next 2 years

# NC 12 Outer Banks





# Come Visit Us!!





# In-Place Recycling State of Texas

Southeastern States In-Place Recycling Conference

August 30 – September 1, 2011

Atlanta, Georgia

Jim Travis Asset Management Engineer FHWA - Texas


### Lone Star State of Texas

FY 2010 Pocket Facts

~ 196,300 Lane Miles

~ 12,000 TxDOT Employees

1,064 Construction Contracts Let

~ \$3.3 Billion Dollars

~ 6.8 Million Tons of HMA Placed

### Types of Hot In-Place Recycling used in Texas

- Recycling
- Remixing
- Repaying





#### Lubbock District









#### Advantages of Using In-Place Recycling

- Multi-Step Single Pass Process
   Conservation of Materials/Resources
- 3. Smaller Carbon Footprint



#### Challenges of Using In-Place Recycling

- 1. Structural Capacity of existing pavement structure
- 2. Multiple Seal Coats & other materials in existing pavement
- 3. Cost Competitiveness



# State Animal of Texas



### Armadillo

# **Thank You**

### Don't mess with Texas

### **Tennessee Department of Transportation**

Barriers to In-Place Recycling Mark E. Woods, P.E. State Bituminous Engineer

- TDOT has spent the last year or so researching fellow state specifications and self educating on in-place processes.
- One barrier is a variation between peer-state specifications in terms of process details, i.e. which process is best for state roads.
- In addition, cost concerns have deterred resurfacing coordinators from trying trial projects. Having to pay for HIP that must still be covered by a different treatment doesn't always seem cost-effective.

#### **Barriers to In-Place Programs**







# In-Place Recycling Activities in Alabama

Southeastern States Regional In-Place Recycling Conference August 30 – September 1, 2011 Atlanta, Georgia

> Mike Harper, PE Assistant Chief Engineer - Operations Alabama Department of Transportation

### ALDOT Organization



67 Counties
41 Districts
9 Divisions

#### **ALDOT Statistics**

#### Approximately 11,000 miles

- Interstate: approximately 1370 miles
- Non-interstate: approximately 9600 miles
- 4,648 employees
- FY 2010 Construction
  - 322 projects awarded
  - \$683.7 million
- **FY 2010** 
  - \$110 M for Interstate Pavement Preservation
  - \$230 M for Resurfacing Program (Minor Rehab and PM)
  - \$7.7 M for Pavement related routine maint treatments

### Alabama State Mammal

#### Black Bear

- Ursus americanus
- Designated by Legislature in 1996
- Not always black
  - Cinnamon (pictured)
  - White
  - Beige
  - Slate gray ("blue")



#### FDR (with cement stabilization)

method of flexible pavement reconstruction that utilizes the existing asphalt, base, and subgrade material to produce a new stabilized base course for an asphalt, chip seal, or concrete wearing surface.

### Experience with In-Place Recycling

In-place recycling projects (last 5 years)

- Cold in-place: None
- Hot in-place: None
- Full Depth Reclamation: See later slide
- Number of Contractors
  - Cold in-place: None
  - Hot in-place: None
  - Full Depth Reclamation: 6 (4 primary)
- Cement-treated base use local materials
- Process for letting projects standard

### Experience with In-Place Recycling



#### FDR in Alabama

#### □ 4% to 8% cement content



### Recycling: RAP and RAS

- Considering raising RAP limits
  - Up to 40% in black base and binder layers
  - Dependent on volumetrics
- Considering changes to RAS (Recycled Asphalt Shingles) specifications
  - Currently allow up to 5% factory rejects and up to 3% tear offs
  - Considering allowing up to 5% tear offs (no change on factory rejects)

#### Why We Use In-Place Recycling

- Availability of aggregates poor in some locations
- FDR
  - Allows stabilization of base
  - Reduces additional structure needed
  - Limited to low volume roads where truck traffic can be diverted

#### Why In-Place Recycling is Not Used More

- Availability of aggregates excellent in many locations
- Lack of process control
- Lack of experience with recycling methods
- Concerns regarding consistently reaching target structural coefficients that can be incorporated into pavement designs
- Use on higher volume routes where truck traffic <u>must</u> be maintained

### Thank You



### **Recycling at MDOT**

#### 2011 Southeastern States Regional In-Place Recycling Conference Atlanta, GA August 30, 2011

Randy Battey Assistant Chief Engineer - Operations Mississippi Department of Transportation

### Pavement Recycling Not New at MDOT

- Utilized RAP for years
- Up to 30% in underlying lifts
- Up to 15% in surface
- Looking to increase
- Improve stockpile processing
- Lowest cost modifier







### MDOT by the Numbers

Employees: 3200

MDOT Maintains: 28,000 lane miles

Federal Aid Local Program (LPA): 7,000 lane miles

Calendar 2010 MDOT awarded 150 projects

150 projects were funded with 340M Federal/220M State

Calendar 2010 MDOT concurred in award of 120 LPA projects

120 LPA projects were funded with 70M Federal/6M Local



#### State Animal: Red Fox







# MDOT by the Numbers

#### But when I think of great recyclers, I think of another Redd Foxx!





# History of In-Place Recycling in Mississippi

- Done some CIR & HIR 15+ years ago
- Not successful
- More recently tried FDR on two projects
- FDR about 50 lane miles some w/emulsion, some with cement
- A couple of LPAs have utilized some HIR recently on non participating projects



### Why Consider FDR?





# In-Place Recycling in MS

- # of MS Contractors doing CIR/HIR/FDR: 0
- Projects utilize conventional design-bid-build
- Research underway






### FDR Costs

6" depth at 5.5% cement - \$5.10 per sq. yd. 9" depth at 5.5% cement - \$5.70 per sq. yd. 16" depth at 6% cement - \$9.25 per sq. yd.

6" depth at 4% emulsion - \$11.30 per sq. yd. 9" depth at 4% emulsion - \$14.89 per sq. yd.

Cement % by volume; Emulsion % by weight



### Why MDOT chose FDR?

- Rebind existing materials
- Take care of the underlying problems





# Why is In-Place Recycling not used more in MS?

- Lack of local industry
- Inexperience with it
- In the case of HIR, had a bad experience about 15+ years ago







# Suggestion to the Industry Concerning In-Place Recycling





# Comments or Questions?



# In-Place Recycling Activities in Georgia

#### SouthEastern States Regional In-Place Recycling Conference

August 30, 2011

David Painter, P.E. Georgia Division, FHWA

Georgene M. Geary, P.E. State Materials and Research Engineer, GDOT





### GDOT Demographics

- ~ 18,000 centerline SR miles
- ~ 48,000 SR travel lane miles
- ~ 117,000 total centerline miles
- □ GDOT -capped at 4,900 FTE's
- FY 2010: ~1 billion dollars in capitol projects
  446 construction projects let
- FY 2011: ~700 million dollars in capitol projects
  - 277 construction projects let





Georgia Department of Transportation

# In-Place Pavement Recycling in Georgia (cumulative yd<sup>2</sup>)

FDR

Mainly
 County
 Roads

Cement or Lime









Why We Are Interested in Using In-Place Recycling

\$\$\$\$Save money\$\$\$

Technology and Information has Improved

**u** \$\$\$No money\$\$\$



# Barriers to Utilizing More In-Place Recycling

Clear guidelines on where/what to use

Experience (GDOT and Contractors)

### Repeatable Specifications



### GEORGIA FACTS

### State Bird



#### Brown Thrasher







# In-Place Recycling Activities in Florida

#### Southeastern States Regional In-Place Recycling Conference August 30 – September 1, 2011 Atlanta, GA

John S. Fowler, P.E. Pavement Management Engineer Florida Department of Transportation

### FDOT Demographics

- **D** FDOT: 7,426 employees
- **12,088** centerline miles
- **u** 42,829 lane miles
- **D** 97.6% flexible, 2.4% rigid
- **D** FY 2010/11 429 construction projects let
- **□** \$6.5 billion



## Experience with In-Place Recycling





#### HOT-IN-PLACE RECYCLING

Projects Constructed 2001 – 2009 (9 projects)

Programmed Projects 2011 – 2014 (4 projects)

Potential Projects 2012 – 2014 (9 projects)





#### COLD-IN-PLACE RECYCLING

Projects Constructed 1997 – 2010 (5 projects)

Programmed Projects 2011 – 2014 (3 projects)

Note: All CIP Recycling projects shown are Aviation projects. CIP not used on FDOT roadways.





#### FULL DEPTH RECLAMATION

Projects Constructed 1971 – 2009 (15 projects)

Note: FDR projects are shown for District 2 only. A comprehensive statewide list of FDR projects was not available.





### Where Are We Using In-Place Recycling

- **D** Interim projects
- **Design ESALs** < 3 million
- **Dense-graded** mixes only
- Roadways with no structural issues or poor soils
- **D** No history of rutting
- □ Friction course not required if Existing FN ≥ 40



### Utilizing More In-Place Recycling

- **D** 2001 2010: About 1 project per year
- **u** 2011 2014: About 3 projects per year
- Better specifications
- **D** More competition
- Need to do more with less \$\$\$









### **D** State Animal: Florida Panther

### **D** State Reptile: American Alligator







### FLORIDA FACTS



### **D** State University: Florida Gators













Thank You



### PUERTO RICO HIGHWAY AND TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY

Southeastern States In-Place Recycling Conference August 30 – September 1, 2011 Atlanta, Georgia

Alvin Gutierrez, PE, ME Area & Materials Engineer – FHWA PR Division



Andrés Alvarez-Ibáñez, PE, MECE Acting Director, Materials Testing Office



### PUERTO RICO'S NATIONAL HIGHWAY SYSTEM (NHS)



# **PRHTA Demographics**

- Number of state employees 1,835
- PR has 28,864 centerline km of roadway or 18,040 miles (4.5 times the road density of mainland USA)
- Annual dollar amount in construction projects \$200MM
- Number of annual construction projects 40
- Puerto Rico Area is about 9,100 sq km or 3,500 sq miles
- Population of 3.7MM
- Number of vehicles 3.0MM

## Experience with In-place recycling

- None
- But a supplier from Wirtgen has been trying to introduce technology (Foamed Asphalt-Cold In Place Recycling) in Puerto Rico for some time.
- The company will sponsor a workshop in the next few months
  - Experience from other states
  - Benefits from this technology
  - Willing to bring small equipment for trial

# State Animal - Coqui





### **In-Place Recycling in Louisiana**

Southeastern States Regional In-Place Recycling Conference August 30 – September 1, 2011 Atlanta, Georgia

Joe Bloise

Assistant Division Administrator, FHWA LA Division

#### William "Bill" King

Asphalt Research Manager, LADOTD

#### **Md Sharear Kabir**

Asphalt Research Engineer Intern, LADOTD

### **LADOT Demographics**

- LADOTD has approx 4,500 employees
- There are 16,700 center line miles of roadway owned by the LADOTD
- Number of annual construction projects:

- FY10 = 447 projects

– FY11 = 245 projects (so far)

- Annual \$\$ of Contracted work:
  - FY10 = \$800M (includes ARRA funding)
  - FY11 = \$245M (with \$170M left to obligate before Sept 30<sup>th</sup>)



### US 90: SP# 003-07-0021

- Type of Recycling: Hot In-Place Recycling AC
- Construction Year: 1990
- Total Cost: \$ 0.7M
- Length: 7.4 miles
- Section lasted for 16 yrs.

http://www.ltrc.lsu.edu/pdf/2005/report\_235.pdf




#### **US 167: SP# 066-08-0010**

- Type of Recycling: Hot In-Place Recycling AC
- Construction Year: 1994
- Total Cost: \$ 1.6M
- Length: 9.2 miles
- Section lasted for 16 yrs.



#### LA 581: SP# 338-01-0014

- Type of Recycling: Full Depth Reclamation
- Construction Year: 2007
- Total Cost: \$ 3.09M
- Length: 4.83 miles



Construction Cost Comparison	
Soil Cement Stabilization	Full Depth Reclamation
\$26.13 per sq yd	\$ 31.43 per sq yd



TYPICAL HALF SECTION FOR PROPOSED ROADWAY

### US 61: SP# 019-02-0051

- Type of Recycling: Cold In-Place
- Construction Year: 2010
- Total Cost: \$ 9.6M (\$ 3M)
- Length: 3.1 miles (12.4 ln mi)









After

#### **Selection/Bidding Process**

- So far Projects were selected for Demonstration/ Research only
- Once a project is selected, Special provision is needed as part of the contract
- Bidding follows the regular LADOTD bid process

#### **Status of In-Place Recycling in LA**

- LADOTD is very inexperienced in Using In-Place Recycling
- Projects done so far have been for Research only
- Why In-Place Recycling is not commonly Utilized:
  - No Local Contractors
  - Local Contractors have not shown Interest
    - Need to purchase new equipment
  - In-Place Recycling becomes MORE EXPENSIVE !!

### **Issues of Concern**

- LADOTD would like to observe:
  - Performance Data for In-place Recycling
    - Long Term Effects
  - Cost/Benefits for Louisiana application.
  - Design Issues Using In-Place Recycling





# Louisiana Facts



• State Bird: Brown Pelican



- Named after King Louis XIV, King of France 1643 – 1715 and Queen Ana
- 18<sup>th</sup> State of the Union
  April 30, 1812
- State Crustacean Crawfish
- State Tree Bald Cypress
- Only State with Parishes (not Counties)

## Mike and Opening Day





## Thank You !!